REPORT TO THE LOUISIANA BOARD OF REGENTS

RECRUITMENT OF SUPERIOR GRADUATE STUDENTS COMPONENT OF THE BOARD OF REGENTS SUPPORT FUND FY 2010-11 COMPETITION FOR AWARDS TO BEGIN IN FY 2012-13

Dr. John Mayfield, Panel Chair Professor Iowa State University

Dr. Charles Ambler
Former Dean of the Graduate School
University of Texas at El Paso

Dr. Roger Chalkley Senior Associate Dean for Biomedical Research Education and Training Vanderbilt University Medical School

> Dr. Suzanne Ortega Executive Vice President and Provost University of New Mexico

INTRODUCTION

The panel urges applicants to read the summary critiques, included in this report, relating to each submitted proposal. Most summaries offer specific suggestions to help applicants design proposals for future competitions of the Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students Program.

The review panel for the Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students Program met in Baton Rouge on February 26 and 27, 2011 to discuss and make funding recommendations relative to proposals submitted in the FY 2010-11 competition for awards to begin in FY 2012-13. Members of the panel were Dr. John Mayfield (Chair), Iowa State University; Dr. Roger Chalkley, Vanderbilt University Medical School; Dr. Charles Ambler, University of Texas at El Paso; and Dr. Suzanne Ortega, University of New Mexico.

Nine (9) institutions submitted a total of twenty-seven (27) proposals within the disciplines eligible for this year's competition in the Traditional Graduate Fellows Program. Two (2) universities submitted a total of two (2) proposals in the Graduate Fellowships for Teachers Program. In some cases two or more departments within an academic unit submitted a single proposal.

Prior to arriving in Baton Rouge, consultants individually read and evaluated each proposal according to the guidelines provided by the Louisiana Board of Regents in the FY 2010-11 Graduate Fellows Request for Proposals. Each consultant assigned a preliminary rating to each proposal before the February meeting. Preliminary composite scores were then computed and facilitated discussions at the panel meeting.

After thorough discussion of the merits of each proposal, the consultants established a rank order for all of the proposals and recommended monetary levels for awards according to established criteria. Recommendations were made consistent with the limits of available funding as determined by the Board of Regents. Final composite scores assigned to the proposals ranged from 65 to 87 out of a maximum of 100. The panel did not recommend funding for those proposals receiving scores of less than 75. A total of \$892,000 of the \$900,000 anticipated to be available in first-year monies was recommended for expenditure. The remaining \$8,000 was insufficient to fund any additional fellowship slots, so was left unexpended.

The total amount of first-year funds requested in the Traditional Graduate Fellows Program was \$2,286,500. The Graduate Fellowships for Teachers proposals requested total first-year funds of \$170,500. Consultants were advised that \$720,000 was allotted for the Traditional Graduate Fellows Program and \$180,000 for the Graduate Fellowships for Teachers Program. The panel was also advised that any funds not committed to proposals submitted for the latter program should be recommended for expenditure under the Traditional Graduate Fellows Program, assuming that a sufficient number of meritorious proposals had been submitted in Traditional GF to warrant the transfer.

The panel recommends that seventeen (17) of the twenty-seven (27) proposals submitted under the Traditional Graduate Fellows Program and both of the proposals submitted under the Graduate Fellowships for Teachers Program be funded in the amounts specified in Appendix A. Appendix B consists of brief narrative summaries of the panel's assessment of each proposal and Appendix C contains a listing of all proposals submitted under each program.

The cumulative requests substantially exceed the total amount of funding available. Panel members made every effort to keep recommendations within established funding limitations as well as in accordance with the collective assessment of each proposal's individual merits. Reviewers sought to ascertain the degree to which each award could bring about the successful recruitment of superior graduate students. Such efforts are consistent with the goal of enhancing the overall quality of higher education in and the social, cultural and

economic development of Louisiana. Moreover, panel members considered in each case whether the dollar value of the requested fellowship stipend would ensure each program's competitiveness with comparable institutions and accord with past recruiting efforts.

Once again, the four panel members commend all involved in this ongoing endeavor to elevate the level of graduate study in Louisiana's institutions of higher education. The members of the panel, collectively and individually, also wish to express their sincere appreciation to the staff of the Louisiana Board of Regents for their aid and support in the completion of this task.

Panel Comments, Recommendations and Suggestions:

- 1. There has been improvement in applicants completing the required tables correctly. There continue, however, to be mistakes, omissions, and misinterpretations of the data requested. Incomplete or error-filled data tables can have serious consequences in panel deliberations. These data are very important to the panel's understanding of graduate programs' strengths and challenges. The panel relies heavily on and carefully analyzes the data in the required tables. If data suggest problems with recruitment, retention, time to degree, minority participation, or other elements of a graduate program, the proposal should specifically address the problem in the narrative and indicate what the program is doing or will do to respond. If data are in conflict, it is almost impossible for the panel to interpret the success of the program or recognize problems/issues.
- 2. Student outcomes following completion of the degree are an extremely important measure of a graduate program's success, and proposals are significantly enhanced by the inclusion of quantitative data on the placement of program graduates. This data should be summarized systematically rather than presented anecdotally in the proposals. To provide guidance for proposal writers, the panel suggests that data include a) the total number of program students awarded degrees over the past 15 years; b) the total number no longer working in the discipline; c) the number currently in postdoctoral positions; d) the number currently working in academia (but not employed as post-doctoral fellows); e) the number employed in industry; and f) the number in other discipline-related careers. If programs do not currently collect such information, the panel encourages them to institute mechanisms for acquiring it. This is especially crucial for GFT proposals, and all GFT proposals should indicate whether the students who received awards continue to teach in Louisiana K-12 classrooms.
- 3. BoR fellowships are intended to enhance the recruitment of more talented and diverse graduate students to programs in Louisiana universities and to improve the overall quality of programs. The panel pays close attention to indications of how past Board funding has leveraged institutional funding to build quality in graduate programs and enhance recruiting. Some programs have received BoR funding for many years. Proposals should provide evidence of how past fellowships have enhanced program quality and what specific plans are in place to utilize new awards to achieve greater eminence.
- 4. Though the terms of BoR fellowships (two years for academic master's, three years for professional master's, and four years for doctoral studies) are insufficient for most students to complete their studies, many proposals do not address the issue of funding of fellowship recipients after BoR fellowship support concludes. Proposals can be enhanced by including plans or pledges regarding the level and duration of support after conclusion of the BoRSF fellowship.

- 5. Proposals are enhanced by clear and systematic mentoring plans coupled with meaningful benchmarks and timelines for satisfactory progress. Descriptions of resources available to students who fall behind or fail to meet benchmarks should be included in addition to the statements describing penalties.
- 6. Recruitment plans that have been in place for many years and are not yielding results should be reevaluated. This panel sometimes sees the same proposals putting forth the same plans and the same results year after year and wonders why plans do not evolve or change, particularly when performance is stagnant or in decline.
- 7. The panel notes that a few proposals still provide names and personal information for students in and graduates of programs seeking funding. **This practice is inappropriate and does not strengthen the proposal in any way.** Applicants are urged to maintain the anonymity of students.
- 8. Though ETS guidelines clearly state that use of composite GRE scores is a misuse of test results and the panel has urged applicants to provide only the scores most relevant to the graduate program for which funding is sought, a handful of proposals continue to provide composite scores. ETS's most recent comments on use of scores may be found at http://www.ets.org/Media/Tests/GRE/pdf/gre_0809_guide.pdf. As in several recent competitions, this year the use of combined scores resulted in substantially reduced scoring by the reviewers.
- 9. There has been great improvement in proper use of the term "under-represented minority". The panel still reminds applicants that Asian Americans and non-citizens who do not have permanent resident status are not to be categorized as under-represented in this competition. The panel continues to note a surprising number of Pacific Islanders and Native Alaskans cited as enrolled in Louisiana graduate programs and urges applicants to make certain that these students are appropriately listed as members of these ethnic categories.
- 10. Economic development is very important to the Board of Regents Support Fund and to the Graduate Fellows panel. Most proposals can be improved by providing specific examples in addition to generalities in their descriptions of economic development potential.
- 11. Applicants are discouraged from including appendices, which are rarely used by the review panel because they are generally over-filled and difficult to navigate. Material should be provided in appendices only when it specifically illustrates or documents points made in the proposal narrative.

APPENDIX A RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUNDING

LOUISIANA BOARD OF REGENTS SUPPORT FUND TRADITIONAL GRADUATE FELLOWS AND GRADUATE FELLOWSHIPS FOR TEACHERS PROGRAMS FY 2010-11 CYCLE FOR AWARDS TO BEGIN IN FY 2012-13

TABLE I PROPOSALS RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING

RANK	PROPOSAL NO.	INSTITUTION	DISCIPLINE	LENGTH/TYPE OF PROGRAM	NUMBER OF FELLOWSHIPS RECOMMENDED	ANNUAL STIPEND AMOUNT	YEAR	TOTAL BORSF MONEY RECOMMENDED	CUMULATIVE AMOUNT OF 1 ST YEAR AWARDS
1	011GF-12	LA TECH	ENGINEERING	4 YR. DOC	3	\$25,000	Year 1	\$ 75,000	\$75,000
							Year 2	\$ 75,000	
							Year 3	\$ 75,000	
							Year 4	\$ 75,000	
							TOTAL	\$300,000	
2	012GF-12	LA TECH	MATHEMATICS	4 YR. DOC	2	\$25,000	Year 1	\$ 50,000	\$125,000
							Year 2	\$ 50,000	
							Year 3	\$ 50,000	
							Year 4	\$ 50,000	
							TOTAL	\$200,000	
3	025GF-12	UL L	BIOLOGICAL	4 YR. DOC	3	\$27,000	Year 1	\$ 81,000	\$206,000
			SCIENCES				Year 2	\$ 81,000	
							Year 3	\$ 81,000	
							Year 4	\$ 81,000	
							TOTAL	\$324,000	
4	004GF-12	LSU-BR	ENGINEERING	4 YR. DOC	3	\$30,000	Year 1	\$ 90,000	\$296,000
							Year 2	\$ 90,000	
							Year 3	\$ 90,000	
							Year 4	\$ 90,000	
							TOTAL	\$360,000	
5	001GF-12	LSU-BR	PHYSICS &	4 YR. DOC	2	\$27,000	Year 1	\$ 54,000	\$350,000
			ASTRONOMY				Year 2	\$ 54,000	
							Year 3	\$ 54,000	
							Year 4	\$ 54,000	
							TOTAL	\$216,000	
6	005GF-12	LSU-BR	CHEMISTRY	4 YR. DOC	1	\$30,000	Year 1	\$ 30,000	\$380,000
							Year 2	\$ 30,000	
							Year 3	\$ 30,000	
							Year 4	\$ 30,000	
							TOTAL	\$120,000	
7	022GF-12	TULANE	HEALTH &	4 YR. DOC	2	\$28,500	Year 1	\$ 57,000	\$437,000
			MEDICAL				Year 2	\$ 57,000	
							Year 3	\$ 57,000	
							Year 4	\$ 57,000	
							TOTAL	\$228,000	

Solution	RANK	PROPOSAL NO.	INSTITUTION	DISCIPLINE	LENGTH/TYPE OF PROGRAM	NUMBER OF FELLOWSHIPS RECOMMENDED	ANNUAL STIPEND AMOUNT	YEAR	TOTAL BORSF MONEY RECOMMENDED	CUMULATIVE AMOUNT OF 1 ST YEAR AWARDS
Section Page 1 Page 2 Page 3	8	019GE-12	THANE	ENGINEERING	4 YR DOC			Vear 1		\$489,000
Year 3 \$52,000 Year 4 \$52,000		01701 12	TOLINE	ENGINEERING	4 TK. DOC	2	Ψ20,000			φ-ιου,000
Year 4 S 52,000 S208,000										
9 003GF-12 LSU-BR MATHEMATICS 4 YR. DOC 2 \$24,000 Year 1 \$48,000 Year 2 \$48,000 Year 3 \$48,000 Year 4 \$48,000 Year 1 \$52,000 MEDICAL Year 2 \$52,000 Year 1 \$52,000 Year 3 \$52,000 Year 3 \$52,000 Year 4 \$60,000 Year 1 Year 2 \$60										
9 003GF-12 LSU-BR MATHEMATICS 4 YR. DOC 2 \$24,000 Year 1 \$48,000 Year 2 \$48,000 Year 3 \$48,000 Year 4 \$548,000 Year 1 \$52,000 Year 1 \$52,000 Year 4 \$528,000 Year 1 \$528,000 Year 1 \$528,000 Year 4 \$528,000 Year 4 \$528,000 Year 4 \$528,000 Year 1 \$528,000 Year 2 \$528,000 Y										
Note	9	003GF-12	LSU-BR	MATHEMATICS	4 YR. DOC	2	\$24,000			\$537,000
10 009GF-12 LSUHSC-NO HEALTH & 4 YR. DOC 2 \$26,000 Year 1 \$52,000 \$589,000 Year 1 \$52,000 Year 3 \$52,000 Year 3 \$52,000 Year 3 \$52,000 Year 4 \$52,000 Year 4 \$52,000 Year 3 \$52,000 Year 3 \$52,000 Year 4 \$52,000 Year 3 \$60,000 Year 3 \$60,000 Year 3 \$60,000 Year 4 \$6										, ,
TOTAL \$192,000								Year 3	\$ 48,000	
10								Year 4	\$ 48,000	
MEDICAL MEDICAL Year 2 \$52,000 Year 3 \$52,000 Year 4 \$52,000 Year 4 \$52,000 Year 4 \$52,000 Year 1 \$60,000 \$649,000 Year 3 \$60,000 Year 4 \$60,000 Year 1 \$60,000 Year 4 \$60,000 Year 4 \$60,000 Year 1 \$60,000 Year 4 \$60,000 Year 1 \$60,000								TOTAL	\$ 192,000	
Year 3	10	009GF-12	LSUHSC-NO	HEALTH &	4 YR. DOC	2	\$26,000	Year 1	\$ 52,000	\$589,000
Year 4 S 52,000 TOTAL \$208,000				MEDICAL				Year 2		
TOTAL \$208,000 \$208,000 \$208,000 \$208,000 \$30,000 \$208,000 \$30,000 \$										
11 021GF-12 TULANE CHEMISTRY 4 YR. DOC 2 \$30,000 Year 1 \$60,000 \$649,000 Year 3 \$60,000 Year 4 \$240,000 Year 1 \$240,000 Year 1 \$52,000 \$701,000 Year 2 \$52,000 \$701,000 Year 2 \$52,000 Year 2 \$52,000 Year 3 \$104,000 Year 4 Year 2 \$104,000 Year 1 \$28,000 Year 1 Year 2 Year 2 Year 3 Year 3 Year 4 Year 3 Year 4										
Year 2 \$60,000 Year 3 \$60,000 Year 4 \$60,000 Year 4 \$60,000 Year 4 \$60,000 Year 4 \$240,000 Year 1 \$52,000 \$701,000 Year 2 \$52,000 Year 2 \$52,000 Year 2 \$52,000 Year 2 \$52,000 Year 3 \$52,000 Year 2 \$52,000 Year 2 \$52,000 Year 3 \$52,000 Year 2 \$52,000 Year 3 \$52,000 Year 2 \$52,000 Year 3 Year 2 Year 2 \$52,000 Year 3 Year 2										
Year 3 \$60,000 Year 4 \$60,000 TOTAL \$240,000	11	021GF-12	TULANE	CHEMISTRY	4 YR. DOC	2	\$30,000			\$649,000
Year 4 \$\frac{\$60,000}{\$240,000} \ 12 007GF-12 LSU-BR										
12 007GF-12 LSU-BR EARTH & 4 YR. DOC 0 \$28,000 Year 1 \$52,000 \$701,000										
12 007GF-12 LSU-BR EARTH & 4 YR. DOC ENVIRONMENTAL ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENCES 4 YR. DOC 2 YR. MASTER'S 0 \$28,000 Year 1 Year 2 \$52,000 Year 1 \$52,000 Year 2 \$52,000 Year 1 \$104,000 \$104,000 Year 1 \$28,000 Year 1 Year 2 Year 2 \$28,000 Year 1 Year 2										
ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENCES 2 YR. MASTER'S 2 \$26,000 TOTAL \$104,000										
SCIENCES 2 YR. MASTER'S 2 \$26,000 TOTAL \$104,000	12	007GF-12	LSU-BR		4 YR. DOC	0	\$28,000			\$701,000
13 020GF-12 TULANE BIOLOGICAL 4 YR. DOC 1 \$28,000 Year 1 \$ 28,000 \$729,000 SCIENCES 1 Year 2 \$ 28,000						_				
SCIENCES Year 2 \$ 28,000							. /			
	13	020GF-12	TULANE		4 YR. DOC	1	\$28,000			\$729,000
				SCIENCES						
								Year 3	\$ 28,000	
Year 4 <u>\$ 28,000</u>										
TOTAL \$112,000	1.4	00.CCE 12	I CII DD	DIOLOGICAL	AMD DOG	1	#20.000			Φ750 000
	14	006GF-12	LSU-BR		4 YR. DOC	1	\$30,000			\$759,000
SCIENCES Year 2 \$ 30,000 Year 3 \$ 30,000				SCIENCES						
Year 4										
	1.5	010CE 12	I SHIRE NO	BIOLOGICAL	4 VP DOC	1	\$25,000			\$784,000
15 010GF-12 LSUHSC-NO BIOLOGICAL 4 YR. DOC 1 \$25,000 Year 1 \$25,000 \$784,000 \$784,000 \$100 \$100 \$100 \$100 \$100 \$100 \$100	13	010GF-12	LSURSC-NO		4 1 K. DOC	1	\$23,000			\$ / 84,000
Year 3 \$ 25,000 Year 3				SCIENCES						
Year 4 \$ 25,000										
TOTAL \$100,000										

RANK	PROPOSAL NO.	INSTITUTION	DISCIPLINE	LENGTH/TYPE OF PROGRAM	NUMBER OF FELLOWSHIPS RECOMMENDED	ANNUAL STIPEND AMOUNT	YEAR	TOTAL BORSF MONEY RECOMMENDED	CUMULATIVE AMOUNT OF 1 ST YEAR AWARDS
16	027GF-12	UNO	CHEMISTRY	4 YR. DOC	1	\$30,000	Year 1	\$ 30,000	\$814,000
							Year 2	\$ 30,000	
							Year 3	\$ 30,000	
							Year 4	\$ 30,000	
							TOTAL	\$120,000	
17	014GF-12	NICHOLLS	BIOLOGICAL	2 YR. MASTER'S	1	\$15,000	Year 1	\$ 15,000	\$829,000
			SCIENCES				Year 2	\$ 15,000	
							TOTAL	\$ 30,000	
1	002GFT-12	MCNEESE	CHEMISTRY	1 YR. MASTER'S	1	\$27,000	Year 1	\$ 27,000	\$856,000
							TOTAL	\$ 27,000	
2	001GFT-12	LSU-BR	EDUCATION	1 YR. MASTER'S	2	\$18,000	Year 1	\$ 36,000	\$892,000
							TOTAL	\$ 36,000	

TABLE II PROPOSALS NOT RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING

PROPOSAL NO.	INSTITUTION	ELIGIBLE DISCIPLINE
002GF-12	LSU-BR	HEALTH & MEDICAL
008GF-12	LSUHSC-NO	HEALTH & MEDICAL
013GF-12	MCNEESE	CHEMISTRY
015GF-12	NICHOLLS	MATHEMATICS
016GF-12	SUBR	EARTH & ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENCES
017GF-12	TULANE	PHYSICS & ASTRONOMY
018GF-12	TULANE	MATHEMATICS
023GF-12	ULL	COMPUTER & INFORMATION SCIENCES
024GF-12	ULL	ENGINEERING
026GF-12	UNO	EDUCATION

APPENDIX B NARRATIVE ASSESSMENTS

COMMENTS ON PROPOSALS SUBMITTED UNDER THE BOARD OF REGENTS SUPPORT FUND PROGRAMS FOR TRADITIONAL GRADUATE FELLOWS AND GRADUATE FELLOWSHIPS FOR TEACHERS

001GF-12 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE

"Graduate Fellows in Physics and Astronomy"

Requested: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$27,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$27,000/annum for 4 years = \$216,000 TOTAL

LSU's Physics Department is one of the strongest on the campus, with good external grant support and long and successful history of graduate student training. The proposal still mentions combined GRE scores even though it is very unlikely that they are used in the student selection process. The panel notes that the program is not reaching its stated goal, set in 2004, of doubling the number of graduate students. The impact of the Department on the State's economy is poorly articulated and the minority recruitment achievements are not strong. In total, however, this is a solid program that measurably benefits Louisiana. Funding is recommended for two doctoral-level fellowships at \$27,000 each for four years.

002GF-12 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE

"Graduate Studies in Comparative Biomedical, Pathobiological, and Veterinary Clinical

Sciences"

Requested: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$27,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: -0-

This is a combined application from three departments in the LSU School of Veterinary Medicine. Last year this proposal was not recommended for BoRSF support largely due to a high rate of attrition and a lack of outcomes information. Certainly in one year the attrition issue has not been (and could not be) resolved, although the proposal argues that the caliber of the entering class is improved. Given the small number of U.S. citizens this remains to be demonstrated conclusively. However, the outcomes aspects have been moved to the School of Veterinary Medicine Development Office, so a more comprehensive perspective on the careers developed by their graduates will be available in the future. The good results presented in the proposal suggest that this program is providing a useful source of research personnel in the specific focus areas of animal disease. Faculty members are well funded and productive and are certainly able to provide a strong environment within which the graduate students can work. The progress of the students in the program is monitored in a largely traditional fashion. Recruitment of underrepresented minority students into the student body continues to require attention. Some effort is being expended in this direction, though as yet activities are not yielding positive results. No funding is recommended.

003GF-12 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE

"Recruitment of Superior Doctoral Students in Mathematics" Requested: 4 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$24,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$24,000/annum for 4 years = \$192,000 TOTAL

The Mathematics Department at LSU has a strong faculty and produces a healthy number of doctorates. The number of applicants with good quantitative GRE scores seems adequate, but the panel notes that nearly all U.S. applicants are admitted. This is troubling when coupled with the large number of students who leave the program without receiving their intended degree. This problem seems less severe for Board of Regents fellows, suggesting that high-quality students do not have issues with the curriculum or work load and, therefore, that the problem resides with admission of less well-prepared students. The recruitment of minorities is adequate but could be better. The Department should look to the LSU Chemistry Department or the University of Iowa Math Department for ideas of how better to recruit under-represented minority students. The direct benefits of the program and its graduates to the economic development of Louisiana are not clearly stated, though a strong case is made that the Board of Regents fellowships make a difference to the overall quality of the program. Funding is recommended for two doctoral-level fellowships at \$24,000 each for four years.

004GF-12 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE

"Board of Regents Fellowships in Engineering 2012-17"

Requested: 4 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years = \$360,000 TOTAL

LSU's strong Engineering faculty maintain per capita extramural funding that appears to exceed national averages. Several promising steps are outlined for improving degree completion rates and time to degree. Especially noteworthy is the development of an online database for tracking student progress. Recent decreases in the number of degrees awarded to under-represented students and the absence of applications in 2009-10 from under-represented students are extremely disappointing. While the strategy of admitting to the doctoral programs only those students who already have master's degrees has promise for increasing the doctoral completion rate, it is important that its impact on under-represented student matriculation is carefully monitored. The connection between degree objectives and economic development is particularly well defined. Also commendable is the institution's commitment to providing a \$5,000 stipend supplement. Funding is recommended for three doctoral-level fellowships at \$30,000 each for four years.

005GF-12 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE

"Chemistry Graduate Fellowships for 2012"

Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$30,000/annum for 4 years = \$120,000 TOTAL

This proposal from a well-funded, active and successful department has many positive aspects, but also raises some significant concerns. Research funding appears healthy and increases in recent years are emphasized. However, the funding level after 2005 actually has not increased significantly except for a jump in 2009. This probably reflects ARRA funding, so will likely not continue. Two points struck the panel. First, although this is a large program, the number of applicants is small and includes many international students, and the Department offers positions to 60% of U.S. applicants. Second, the program suffers from constant attrition. The reported rate is 65% overall, but includes 50% of under-represented minority students since 2003. Though the Department has an admirable record of recruiting under-represented minority students, there appears to be a lack of either academic readiness or effective mentoring of these students. In fact, the educational program as outlined seems to be highly focused on testing and there is no evidence of mentoring across the faculty, though clearly some faculty members are making efforts in this direction. Also, it is impossible to read this proposal without sensing an undercurrent of conflict in faculty/student relations. The proposal indicates that sometimes faculty do not wish to be reminded of mentoring responsibilities. This attitude is made more poignant by the statement that the students are "critical for faculty... to perform excellent research." Students should not exist just to serve as assistants to faculty, and faculty should be acutely aware of their responsibilities to the students. The proposal contains significant personal information about previous Board of Regents fellows, which should be removed prior to the next submission. Given panel concerns about attrition and student support, funding is recommended for one doctoral fellowship at \$30,000 for four years.

006GF-12 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE

"Graduate Fellowships in Biological Sciences at Louisiana State University" Requested: 4 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$30,000/annum for 4 years = \$120,000 TOTAL

This is a reasonably strong application from a well-funded department. The Biological Sciences Department at LSU is very complex in its structure, in essence awarding two tracks of PhD. The program for the graduate students is a little unusual in today's terms in that students are encouraged to identify a faculty mentor before they arrive, though the possibility of short rotations exists if such an arrangement has not been achieved at matriculation. As has been noted in previous years, program attrition appears to be disturbingly high, both in the program as a whole and among Board of Regents fellows. Over the last six years this program annually, on average, has graduated 14.5 students and lost close to 17. The situation for hard-won under-represented minority students is equally bleak, with five such students graduating over this time period, and ten leaving the program. The program seems to have a high regard for mentoring so reasons for the poor retention record are not immediately apparent. However, looking at the low

selectivity among U.S. applicants, the panel wonders if the program is taking too many risks with underqualified students in order to keep numbers high. This is not a wise course and the consequences are readily apparent. Nevertheless, the program is strong and plans for student support well defined. The panel recommends one doctoral fellowship at \$30,000 per year for four years.

007GF-12 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE

"Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Earth, Ocean and Environmental Science"
Requested: 4 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$28,000/annum for 4 years
4 Master's-Level Fellowships at \$26,000/annum for 2 years

Recommended: 2 Master's-Level Fellowships at \$26,000/annum for 2 years = \$104,000 TOTAL

Earth, Ocean and Environmental Sciences represents an important research area for LSU and for the State of Louisiana. The proposal involves three programs – Oceanography & Coastal Sciences, Geology & Geophysics, and Environmental Sciences – each of which offers a master's degree and the first two doctoral degrees as well. Collectively the faculty has a strong record of publication and reasonable success in attracting external funding. A recent cluster of hires related to coastal systems and coastal sustainability initiatives promises to substantially enhance the research profile of these programs. The proposal provides strong evidence of the development of research collaborations across departmental lines, a direction that will be highly beneficial to graduate students and faculty. The proposal does not make an effective case for the quality of the two PhD programs or for their importance to the economic development of the State. Given the data provided, the panel continues to have serious concerns regarding the lack of selectivity and the low level of under-represented minority enrollments. Form 10-GF for doctoral students appears to report larger numbers of students enrolling than were offered admission. The panel was very impressed, however, with the arguments made for the importance of master's training to the workforce needs of Gulf Coast states and the evidence suggests that these programs are very healthy. Funding is recommended for two master's-level fellowships of \$26,000 each for two years.

008GF-12 LSU HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER – NEW ORLEANS

"Graduate Training in Molecular Biology, Genetic Control of Inflammation and Cancer" Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$25,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: <u>- 0 -</u>

This is a young program which is still developing its strengths and determining its direction. The number of students enrolled seems to be on the decline, though completion rates are good. The number of applications is very small and as a result selectivity is poor. It appears that no applications are received from under-represented minority students. Efforts to increase the number of applicants and matriculants appear to be largely passive. The panel saw no evidence of follow-up on efforts to recruit at Xavier University. The program is very prescriptive, the course requirements are high and the argument that the faculty need the students to do their research is counterproductive in this context. The proposal's insistence on this last point gives the impression that students exist primarily as a source of faculty support. The panel is not confident that fellowships will have any significant impact on the quality of student this program can attract, or the quality of the program itself. No funding is recommended.

009GF-12 LSU HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER – NEW ORLEANS

"Recruitment of Superior Doctoral Students in Public Health Sciences" Requested: 6 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$26,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$26,000/annum for 4 years = \$208,000 TOTAL

This is a request for six Board of Regents fellows in LSUHSC's School of Public Health. This is a very small program, though it seems to be successful. The program is well described and the faculty, though few in number, are well funded. The proposal is carefully and thoughtfully prepared; plans for student mentoring in particular are excellent. The major concern is the small number of applicants and resulting low selectivity. In addition, the program's attempts to attract under-represented minority students have not achieved great success, though program administrators are clearly giving considerable thought to the issue. The proposal needs to do a better job of explaining how the award of Board of Regents fellowships can actually lead to stronger and more productive

outcomes, as opposed to simply providing extra graduate student support. Given the small size of the program and the limited resources available to Graduate Fellows, it is difficult to justify so many slots (which would take about 20% of available funding for one proposal). Funding is recommended for two doctoral-level fellowships at \$26,000 each for four years.

010GF-12 LSU HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER – NEW ORLEANS

"Training in Integrative Pharmacology and Experimental Therapeutics" Requested: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$25,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$25,000/annum for 4 years = \$100,000 TOTAL

A very positive faculty-to-student ratio ensures that students in this program receive careful research mentoring. The impact of this mentoring is evident in the success students have had in securing nationally competitive fellowships, such as the Ruth Kirschstein Fellowship. While the potential economic development impact of novel therapeutics and biotechnology industries seems self-evident, the proposal includes no evidence of direct industry connections. It is extremely unfortunate that the program continues to use combined GRE scores as an admission criterion despite repeated reminders from this panel and ETS that doing so flagrantly disregards valid use of test scores. The lack of success in enrolling under-represented minority students in this program is very disappointing, and the current recruitment strategy shows little promise for changing this. It is inappropriate to include the names of individual students and fellowship recipients and their academic performance in a proposal of this sort. Reviewers had some question as to whether the proposed \$25,000 stipend was sufficient to attract the best students. Funding is recommended for one doctoral-level fellowship at \$25,000 per year for four years.

011GF-12 LOUISIANA TECH UNIVERSITY

"Superior Graduate Fellows Supporting Three Centers of Excellence in Engineering" Requested: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$25,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$25,000/annum for 4 years = \$300,000 TOTAL

Faculty and students in Louisiana Tech's Engineering Centers of Excellence are closely linked to industry partners through contracts, start-up companies, patents and licensing, and industry advisory boards. The Centers and related graduate program are serving an important regional niche. The focus on recruiting undergraduates from Louisiana Tech and other universities in the region has generated improvement in the number of domestic students seeking advanced degrees. Particularly promising is the new concurrent enrollment strategy. The advance grant should facilitate an increase in the number of women pursuing advanced degrees and faculty positions in engineering. The University has clearly invested in this program by committing an additional stipend supplement to enhance proposed Board of Regents fellowships. Despite these practices, the number of U.S. applicants for graduate degree programs remains low and developing a national or international profile will depend upon a wider recruiting network. The panel commends the \$5,000 stipend supplement provided by the institution. Full funding is recommended for three doctoral-level fellowships at \$25,000 each for four years.

012GF-12 LOUISIANA TECH UNIVERSITY

"Computational Analysis and Modeling Doctoral Graduate Fellows 2012-2016" Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$25,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$25,000/annum for 4 years = \$200,000 TOTAL

Computational Analysis and Modeling is one of three PhD programs in the College of Engineering and Science at Louisiana Tech. The innovative administrative structure of the University means that all graduate programs in the sciences and engineering are interdisciplinary. This is a real benefit. This program seems to do a remarkable job with limited resources provided by the State and has a well documented positive impact on economic development. The \$5,000 supplement is also a strength of the proposal. Minority recruiting efforts seem to be yielding results. Board of Regents fellowships will likely have a very positive impact on the quality of the program. Full funding is recommended for two doctoral-level fellowships at \$25,000 each for four years.

013GF-12 McNEESE STATE UNIVERSITY

"MSU's GF for a M.S. in Environmental and Chemical Sciences" Requested: 4 Master's-Level Fellowships at \$20,000/annum for 2 years

Recommended: <u>- 0 -</u>

An energetic faculty in agriculture, chemistry and environmental sciences has built a strong regional master's program at McNeese State. Although few students receive support and many attend part time, the program has attracted a reasonable pool of applicants and has a good mix of international and U.S. students, including underrepresented minorities. The proposal provides anecdotal evidence that graduates go into industry, teaching and doctoral programs, but a more compelling case could be made for the value of the program to economic development. The program claims to graduate 95% of the students who enroll, thanks to careful mentoring, but the data provided suggest high attrition. This may reflect the fact that most applicants seem to be offered admission. A number of faculty are active researchers and a few have achieved national recognition for their work, notwithstanding very substantial teaching responsibilities. The proposal argues that Board of Regents fellowships would enable the program to build a base of full-time students who would further develop this research activity, but there is less evidence for the inherent importance of an educational program such as this. No funding is recommended at this time.

014GF-12 NICHOLLS STATE UNIVERSITY

"Enhancement of Marine and Environmental Biology Student Recruitment through Graduate Fellow Program"

Requested: 3 Master's-Level Fellowships at \$15,000/annum for 2 years

Recommended: 1 Master's-Level Fellowship at \$15,000/annum for 2 years = \$30,000 TOTAL

Nicholls State has capitalized on its location in the heart of one of the most important wetlands environments in the United States to establish an active marine and environmental biology program. Designated as an area of excellence by the Board of Regents, the program has attracted a core of research-active faculty who have strong records of publication and modest external funding. The program takes appropriate advantage of linkages with a number of other universities and research centers, including the Louisiana Universities Marine Consortium (LUMCON) facility in Cocodrie. The program has apparently been successful in attracting relatively high-quality students, although incomplete data make it difficult to assess retention and minority student enrollment. Future proposals might provide a more systematic explanation of how Board of Regents fellowships would leverage the development of the program. The Department has undertaken a commendable effort to track graduates, but it should be noted that it is not accepted practice to combine verbal and quantitative GRE scores. Funding is recommended for one master's-level fellowship at \$15,000 per year for two years.

015GF-12 NICHOLLS STATE UNIVERSITY

"Nicholls State University Graduate Mathematics Fellowship Program" Requested: 2 Master's-Level Fellowships at \$16,000/annum for 3 years

Recommended: -0-

The Nicholls State Mathematics master's program seems solid and plays an active role in the training of high school and community college math teachers, though some graduates go on to other careers. Recruiting seems to take place principally from the pool of existing high school math teachers. Many potential recruits cannot take a year or two off to pursue a master's degree, so the program described in this proposal is primarily a distance program. This raises the question of whether fellowships will have any great impact on the quality of other students in the program. Table 10-GF indicates that all applicants are offered admission; if true, this suggests the program lacks admission standards. Overall the proposal does not convince the reviewers that fellowship students will markedly improve the quality of education or research in the Department. No funding is recommended.

016GF-12 SOUTHERN UNIVERSITY AND A&M COLLEGE – BATON ROUGE

"Research Excellence in Environmental Toxicology at Southern University" Requested: 4 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: <u>- 0 -</u>

This program focuses on an area of great potential importance for the State and the region. The research and training undertaken in conjunction with the PhD program would produce professionals and knowledge that could support economic development associated with environmental pollution, but little information is provided on actual linkages to industry. The data furnished are unclear, but appear to show that there is little selectivity in admissions. Although the program appears to have had a good record of recruiting minority students, there has been heavy attrition, including among Board of Regents fellows. Recognizing the program's marginal status, the Department has brought in new leadership and implemented a revised approach to recruitment and systemic mentoring, but these changes have not yet brought measurable results. There is serious cause for concern about faculty research productivity and funding; no students are supported on research grants. Although the current proposal represents a positive step, it is unlikely the Board of Regents fellowships could attract high-quality students at this time. No funding is recommended.

017GF-12 TULANE UNIVERSITY

"Superior Graduate Fellows in Physics and Engineering Physics"
Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$28,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: -0-

This proposal is much more positive than those in previous years, perhaps reflecting more optimism at Tulane. The very high national ranking of the Department is eye-opening, but is hard to reconcile with the data provided. How a faculty of six (active) can be ranked similarly to Stanford is a puzzle. One must conclude that those six faculty members are very good indeed; but why is it that this reputation does not translate into more U.S. applications? Plans to build in the area of materials science are progressing and it will be interesting to see how this develops over the next few years. The economic development benefits and minority recruitment seem high in promise and low in actual results. The number of applications to the program remains relatively small, but the incoming students seem to be of good quality. Fourteen of twenty PhD students supported on teaching assistantships seem too many for a research-active department. Another source of concern is the high ratio of dropouts to graduations (6:9 over the past four years, according to Table 11-GF). Finally, the panel notes that over the past five years only one underrepresented minority student has been enrolled and that individual dropped out. Board of Regents fellowships would likely improve the recruitment of the best U.S. applicants and thus improve the department, but other shortcomings temper the panel's enthusiasm. No funding is recommended.

018GF-12 TULANE UNIVERSITY

"Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Mathematics" Requested: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$22,500/annum for 4 years

Recommended: -0-

Although the Tulane Mathematics Department has a distinguished past and outstanding faculty at the present time, there are problems with this proposal. In general it seems to be out of touch with current realities of graduate education. The requested stipend of \$22,500 is likely too low to recruit the best students. Form 11-GF, which is filled out incorrectly, seems to indicate a significant retention problem with more students leaving the program without a degree than graduating in each year. This experience is mirrored in the history of Board of Regents fellows (Form 9-GF) with more dropping out (three) than staying in the program (two). At this time, running a graduate program on a "sink or swim" basis is not the way to success. A department must invest significant effort in pre-selection, mentoring, and nurturing its future scholars. The lack of summer support for students is shocking. What do students do in the summer? Perhaps the biggest opportunity not realized in this proposal is documentation of the success of the VIGRE grant. A reviewer said it had a huge impact on graduate education in the Department. What was it? This experience is completely relevant to the projected success of Board of Regents fellows and omitting it from this proposal leaves the panel guessing. Finally, the proposal includes essentially no discussion of

the economic benefits to the State and displays a weak record of minority student recruitment. No funding is recommended.

019GF-12 TULANE UNIVERSITY

"Graduate Fellowships in Support of Biomedical and Chemical and Biomolecular

Engineering"

Requested: 4 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$26,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$26,000/annum for 4 years = \$208,000 TOTAL

Tulane's strong Engineering research faculty generates significant extramural funding and has set high admissions standards for incoming doctoral students. A plan to develop a bio-innovation program holds great promise for more directly linking faculty and student research with industry and governmental agency needs. These efforts should be pursued even if the current IGERT program is not funded. Data suggest that there have been no under-represented minority students enrolled since 2006. It is clear current recruitment strategies are not working and without additional aggressive efforts on the part of faculty this extremely unfortunate trend is unlikely to be reversed. While the proposal narrative suggests that there have recently been two African American and two Hispanic Board of Regents fellows, their presence is not evident in the enrollment numbers submitted. Nevertheless, reviewers are convinced that the program has promise and room to grow; it is a strong investment for the Board of Regents. Funding is recommended for two doctoral-level fellowships at \$26,000 per year for four years.

020GF-12 TULANE UNIVERSITY

"Recruiting Superior Graduate Students in Ecology and Evolutionary Biology" Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$28,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$28,000/annum for 4 years = \$112,000 TOTAL

The recent oil spill in the Gulf of Mexico has illustrated the importance to the State of research related to tropical biology, wetlands ecology and related fields. Thus, the Tulane Ecology and Evolutionary Biology program is well positioned to provide research and training critical to Louisiana's economic development. Recent strategic hires promise to more closely align faculty strengths with these areas of focus. However, the proposal could make a more explicit and effective argument for the importance of this program to the State's economic development. Faculty members have very good records of publication and have succeeded in winning substantial external funding although more emphasis might be placed on providing support for students. The program seems have a good track record of attracting and retaining high-quality students; more attention should be paid to attracting under-represented minority applications. The most recent data indicate that last year few students applied and none were admitted. The proposal should explain this potentially serious development. Funding is recommended for one doctoral fellowship at \$28,000 per year for four years.

021GF-12 TULANE UNIVERSITY

"Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Chemistry" Requested: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$30,000/annum for 4 years = \$240,000 TOTAL

The Chemistry Department at Tulane has a moderately sized doctoral program. In the last six years 24 doctoral students have graduated (i.e., four per year) and approximately two students per year have left without the degree (excluding the Katrina year). The program has also enrolled a number of under-represented minority students, though again their graduation rate appears to be relatively low. However, since some of these are fifth- and sixth-year students, this may be corrected over the next year. Nonetheless, only one such student has enrolled over the last four years, so clearly some improvement is warranted. The proposal outlines a reasonable plan for trying to recruit more U.S. students and to improve program selectivity, though it is difficult to find an approach certain to be successful. Graduate student recruitment is highly competitive and success comes largely from the reputation of the Department rather than marginal factors, such as an attractive website, and it takes time to establish a premier reputation. The mentoring approaches seem considerate and reasonable. The proposal does outline strategies for improving recruitment of under-represented minority students. The panel strongly advises that the wording in such

recruitment activities not state, as mentioned in the proposal, that students contributing to diversity will be given "special consideration". It is preferable to indicate that the program seeks applications from a diverse community of qualified students. Funding is recommended for two doctoral-level fellowships at \$30,000 per year for four years.

022GF-12 TULANE UNIVERSITY

"Superior Graduate Students in Neuroscience / 2012-2017"
Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$28,500/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$28,500/annum for 4 years = \$228,000 TOTAL

The proposal this year is much more forward-looking than last year's, with a clear indication that Tulane is committed to building the program. The interdisciplinary graduate major has a long history of support from the Board of Regents. One-third of the students in the program (nine of 28) are supported by BoRSF fellowships. Disappointingly, only one of 28 students is supported on research funding. This is an odd statistic and may indicate that faculty are less invested in Neuroscience students than students in other majors. The excellent outcomes of the Neuroscience students, however, partially ease this worry. The panel does feel that no program should depend on the Board of Regents as its primary source of student support, and expects in the future to see a greater fraction of students funded from research grants. Board of Regents fellowships should complement rather than replace normal research funding in a research-intensive program. The number of U.S. applications last year was adequate but not overwhelming. Perhaps the program could be better advertised. Minority recruitment is disappointing and there is a discrepancy between the stipend request in the text and the budget. Funding is recommended for two doctoral-level fellowships at \$28,500 per year for four years.

023GF-12 UNIVERSITY OF LOUISIANA AT LAFAYETTE

"Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Computer Science and Computer

Engineering"

Requested: 2 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$27,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: - 0 -

Two graduate programs are combined under the umbrella of the Center for Advanced Computer Studies (CACS). The combined programs have 15 faculty (one fewer than last year) and 181 graduate students including 76 PhD students. Five PhD students per faculty member is a high ratio for effective mentoring. Eleven PhD students graduated last year, which is a strong result. The declining number of under-represented minority doctoral students over the past five years (to zero last year) suggests a lack of commitment to this important dimension of student training. The pool of applications appears to be too small, with two applications in each of the past two years. It appears that all aspects of recruitment need improvement. Tables 10- and 11-GF do not agree, showing a growing program but with more students leaving than entering. The economic development section is positive if somewhat vague, and retention of Board of Regents fellows seems to have improved. The outcomes of Regents fellows is somewhat disappointing (page 9), though some CACS graduates over the years have done quite well (appendix). Overall the proposal gives the impression of a program with active faculty and in need of fewer, better graduate students. No funding is recommended.

024GF-12 UNIVERSITY OF LOUISIANA AT LAFAYETTE

"Structural Engineering Program Development Fellowships"

Requested: 3 Master's-Level Fellowships at \$20,000/annum for 2 years

Recommended: - 0 -

This proposal requests support for master's-level students in the area of structural engineering, a newly emerging area of emphasis for UL Lafayette. While the decaying infrastructure of Louisiana's bridges is clearly a problem, the connection to economic development in the State is not well elaborated. There are two major weaknesses in the current proposal. First, the program has virtually no domestic applicants and those who do matriculate are part-time. The recruitment strategy for changing the applicant pool does not appear innovative or promising. Second, admission algorithms that depend upon combined GRE scores contradict ETS guidance regarding the appropriate use of test scores. This practice is simply unacceptable. In summary, while the PI appears to be doing an excellent

job of building the structural engineering area of emphasis, the panel is concerned that one person cannot comprise a competitive graduate program. No funding is recommended.

025GF-12 UNIVERSITY OF LOUISIANA AT LAFAYETTE

"Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Environmental and Evolutionary Biology for 2012"

Requested: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$27,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 3 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$27,000/annum for 4 years = \$324,000 TOTAL

The UL Lafayette doctoral program in Environmental and Evolutionary Biology continues to be strong, attracting very impressive students. The faculty are active researchers, working in areas of great importance to the economic development of the State, including a number of areas related to the deepwater Gulf oil spill. The Department maintains close ties with the USGS National Wetlands Research Center, the NOAA Estuarine Habitats and Coastal Fisheries Center, the Louisiana Universities Marine Consortium, and the University's New Iberia Research Center. Areas of expertise in the Department include coastal restoration, molecular phylogenetics, aquatic ecology, ecotoxicology (relationship of organisms to environmental pollution), wetlands ecology, microbial ecology, conservation biology, systematics and diversity of various groups of aquatic organisms, and population genetics. The proposal makes a good case for the importance of research and training in these areas to the Louisiana economy. Program faculty members have brought in substantial external funding, although there is concern that some faculty members lack grant support. The program has attracted an expanding number of U.S. applicants, resulting in rising selectivity. Minority numbers have increased. Greater attention might be paid to mentoring to ensure higher levels of retention. Funding is recommended to support three doctoral fellowships at \$27,000 each per year for four years.

026GF-12 UNIVERSITY OF NEW ORLEANS

"UNO College of Education Urban Education Graduate Fellowship Project" Requested: 4 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$32,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: - 0 -

This proposal identifies a compelling need for scholars who actually understand the positive and negative features of charter schools and for leaders who can promote organizational learning within them. Special education in this context seems to demand particular attention. However, the proposal does not demonstrate a clear connection between the research interests, funded and unfunded, of current faculty, and the proposed recruitment of new doctoral students. The need for doctorally prepared educators as either researchers or agents of systemic change must be more strongly made. It is unlikely that the addition of only four new full-time doctoral students could create a cohort of researchers necessary to sustain a vital research community. It is also unclear whether the proposed \$32,000 stipend will be sufficient to entice individuals to give up full-time jobs for four years to pursue full-time graduate study. Proposed undergraduate GPA and GRE standards for fellows seem somewhat low. No funding is recommended.

027GF-12 UNIVERSITY OF NEW ORLEANS

"Graduate Fellowships for the Doctoral Program in Chemistry at the University of New Orleans"

Requested: 4 Doctoral-Level Fellowships at \$32,000/annum for 4 years

Recommended: 1 Doctoral-Level Fellowship at \$30,000/annum for 4 years = \$120,000 TOTAL

The UNO Chemistry Department is strong and well funded. It is continuing to rebuild faculty numbers and is close to restoring pre-Katrina capacity. The proposal states that the graduate program would be rebuilt to 100 students by 2010. However, Form 11-GF does not support this claim. Currently the program houses 62 students, and the trajectory for growth is only slightly positive. Attrition is fairly low. Looking back over the performance of Board of Regents fellows since 2001 the panel notes that two have dropped, one graduated and the rest are still in the program. While it is still early to make an assessment, graduate program administrators need to monitor these numbers as they evolve over the next year. The outcomes of previous fellows in terms of career activity are quite

good, and the mentoring system in place should help support students in the program. The program desperately needs to address the low numbers of U.S. applicants, and particularly the fact that offers to under-represented minority candidates over the last five years have been zero. The requested stipend of \$32,000 still seems high both in relationship with national norms and proposals submitted in the Graduate Fellowships program. Funding is recommended for one doctoral-level fellowship at \$30,000 per year for four years.

001GFT-12 LOUISIANA STATE UNIVERSITY – BATON ROUGE

"Improving Classroom Interest in Science and Mathematics by Preparing Highly Qualified Teachers 2012-2013"

Requested: 8 Master's-Level Fellowships at \$18,000/annum for 1 year

Recommended: 2 Master's-Level Fellowships at \$18,000/annum for 1 year = \$36,000 TOTAL

There are few needs more compelling than the need for innovative K-12 math and science teachers. There are few challenges more difficult than increasing their numbers and retaining them. The Holmes program at LSU has an important role to play in this regard, both in the State and in the nation. Despite many years of investment by the Board of Regents, the number of students actually matriculating in the math and science tracks remains disappointingly low. While the past year showed significant increases in the number of matriculants in the science program, it is too early to tell if this is a one-year vagary or a trend. It appears that the program continues to use combined GRE scores despite ETS rules and this panel's repeated admonitions. The 450 minimum Verbal score for current students is also disappointing. Enrollment data do not allow for parsing under-represented minority students by area of focus. Thus, it is unclear what progress has been made in recruiting and graduating new master's-prepared science and math teachers from racially and ethnically diverse populations. Future Board of Regents funding should be contingent upon the proposal demonstrating how such funding actually makes a difference in elevating the academic stature of the program. Also missing from the proposal are data demonstrating improvements in teacher quality and retention as a result of completing the Holmes program. This is particularly problematic because the purpose of the GFT program is to provide additional preparation of in-service teachers. Funding is recommended for two one-year master's fellowships at \$18,000 each.

002GFT-12 McNEESE STATE UNIVERSITY

"MSU's GFT Program for a M.S. in Environmental and Chemical Sciences" Requested: 1 Master's-Level Fellowship at \$26,500/annum for 1 year

Recommended: 1 Master's-Level Fellowship at \$27,000/annum for 1 year = \$27,000 TOTAL

This is a request for support for one teacher fellow at McNeese State University, in the Chemistry Department. The Department appears to be energetic and dedicated to this program. The courses and thesis research are demanding, but likely to provide an excellent basis for training of science (chemistry) teachers. The overall success of this program over the past several years, and particularly with Board of Regents fellows, is encouraging; only one teacher has dropped out of the program over this time period. The proposal would be strengthened by an evaluation of the impact of this program on area schools. Certainly the panel is told that the number of chemistry students at McNeese has increased in recent years, but at affected schools how do principals assess the program, how do AP students perform compared to before, how do high school students rate their teachers, etc.? There are a number of metrics one might use, and it would be nice to see some sort of analysis along these lines. Since the fellowship funds are supporting in-service teachers on sabbaticals/leaves of absence, the stipend still seems somewhat low. Funding is recommended for one one-year master's fellowship at \$27,000.

APPENDIX C LISTS OF PROPOSALS SUBMITTED

Traditional Graduate Fellows Program 2010-11 Competition Proposals Submitted

Proposal#/ Discipline	PI Name(s)	Institution	Proposal Title	Duration	Funds Requested
001GF-12 PHYS	Dana Browne	LSU-Baton Rouge	Graduate Fellows in Physics and Astronomy	4 years 3 PhD @ \$27K	Y1: \$81,000 Y2: \$81,000 Y3: \$81,000 Y4: \$81,000 Total: \$324,000
002GF-12 HM	James Miller	LSU-Baton Rouge	Graduate Studies in Comparative Biomedical, Pathobiological, and Veterinary Clinical Sciences	4 years 3 PhD @ \$27K	Y1: \$81,000 Y2: \$81,000 Y3: \$81,000 <u>Y4: \$81,000</u> Total: \$324,000
003GF-12 MATH	Leonard Richardson	LSU-Baton Rouge	Recruitment of Superior Doctoral Students in Mathematics	4 years 4 PhD @ \$24K	Y1: \$96,000 Y2: \$96,000 Y3: \$96,000 <u>Y4: \$96,000</u> Total: \$384,000
004GF-12 ENG	Kelly Rusch	LSU-Baton Rouge	Board of Regents Fellowships in Engineering 2012-17	4 years 4 PhD @ \$30K	Y1: \$120,000 Y2: \$120,000 Y3: \$120,000 <u>Y4: \$120,000</u> Total: \$480,000
005GF-12 CHEM	George Stanley	LSU-Baton Rouge	Chemistry Graduate Fellowships for 2012	4 years 2 PhD @ \$30K	Y1: \$60,000 Y2: \$60,000 Y3: \$60,000 Y4: \$60,000 Total: \$240,000

006GF-12 BIO	Jacqueline Stephens	LSU-Baton Rouge	Graduate Fellowships in Biological Sciences at Louisiana State University	4 years 4 PhD @ \$30K	Y1: \$120,000 Y2: \$120,000 Y3: \$120,000 <u>Y4: \$120,000</u> Total: \$480,000
007GF-12 EAR	R. Eugene Turner	LSU-Baton Rouge	Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Earth, Ocean and Environmental Science	4 years/2 years 4 PhD @ \$28K 4 MS @ \$26K	Y1: \$164,000 Y2: \$164,000 Y3: \$164,000 <u>Y4: \$164,000</u> Total: \$656,000
008GF-12 HM	Diptasri Mandal	LSUHSC-New Orleans	Graduate Training in Molecular Biology, Genetic Control of Inflammation and Cancer	4 years 2 PhD @ \$25K	Y1: \$50,000 Y2: \$50,000 Y3: \$50,000 <u>Y4: \$50,000</u> Total: \$200,000
009GF-12 HM	Donald Mercante	LSUHSC-New Orleans	Recruitment of Superior Doctoral Students in Public Health Sciences	4 years 6 PhD @ \$26K	Y1: \$156,000 Y2: \$156,000 Y3: \$156,000 <u>Y4: \$156,000</u> Total: \$624,000
010GF-12 BIO	Emel Songu-Mize	LSUHSC-New Orleans	Training in Integrative Pharmacology & Experimental Therapeutics	4 years 3 PhD @ \$25K	Y1: \$75,000 Y2: \$75,000 Y3: \$75,000 <u>Y4: \$75,000</u> Total: \$300,000

011GF-12 ENG	James Palmer	LA Tech University	Superior Graduate Fellows Supporting Three Centers of Excellence in Engineering	4 years 3 PhD @ \$25K	Y1: \$75,000 Y2: \$75,000 Y3: \$75,000 Y4: \$75,000 Total: \$300,000
012GF-12 MATH	Bala Ramachandran	LA Tech University	Computational Analysis and Modeling Doctoral Graduate Fellows 2012-2016	4 years 2 PhD @ \$25K	Y1: \$50,000 Y2: \$50,000 Y3: \$50,000 <u>Y4: \$50,000</u> Total: \$200,000
013GF-12 CHEM	Omar Christian	McNeese State University	MSU's GF for a M.S. in Environmental and Chemical Sciences	2 years 4 MS @ \$20K	Y1: \$80,000 Y2: \$80,000 Total: \$160,000
014GF-12 BIO	Raj Boopathy	Nicholls State University	Enhancement of Marine and Environmental Biology Student Recruitment through Graduate Fellow Program	2 years 3 MS @ \$15K	Y1: \$45,000 <u>Y2: \$45,000</u> Total: \$90,000
015GF-12 MATH	DesLey Plaisance	Nicholls State University	Nicholls State University Graduate Mathematics Fellowship Program	3 years 2 MS @ \$16K	Y1: \$32,000 Y2: \$32,000 <u>Y2: \$32,000</u> Total: \$96,000
016GF-12 EAR	John Owens	Southern University at Baton Rouge	Research Excellence in Environmental Toxicology at Southern University	4 years 4 PhD @ \$30K	Y1: \$120,000 Y2: \$120,000 Y3: \$120,000 Y4: \$120,000 Total: \$480,000

017GF-12 PHYS	Dae Ho Kim	Tulane University	Superior Graduate Fellows in Physics and Engineering Physics	4 years 2 PhD @ \$28K	Y1: \$56,000 Y2: \$56,000 Y3: \$56,000 <u>Y4: \$56,000</u> Total: \$224,000
018GF-12 MATH	Alexander Kurganov	Tulane University	Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Mathematics	4 years 3 PhD @ \$22.5K	Y1: \$67,500 Y2: \$67,500 Y3: \$67,500 <u>Y4: \$67,500</u> Total: \$270,000
019GF-12 ENG	Lawrence Pratt	Tulane University	Graduate Fellowships in Support of Biomedical and Chemical & Biomolecular Engineering	4 years 4 PhD @ \$26K	Y1: \$104,000 Y2: \$104,000 Y3: \$104,000 <u>Y4: \$104,000</u> Total: \$416,000
020GF-12 BIO	Corinne Richards- Zawacki	Tulane University	Recruiting Superior Graduate Students in Ecology and Evolutionary Biology	4 years 2 PhD @ \$28K	Y1: \$56,000 Y2: \$56,000 Y3: \$56,000 <u>Y4: \$56,000</u> Total: \$224,000
021GF-12 CHEM	Igor Rubtsov	Tulane University	Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Chemistry	4 years 3 PhD @ \$30K	Y1: \$90,000 Y2: \$90,000 Y3: \$90,000 Y4: \$90,000 Total: \$360,000

022GF-12 HM	Jeffrey Tasker	Tulane University	Superior Graduate Students in Neuroscience / 2012-2017	4 years 2 PhD @ \$28.5K	Y1: \$57,000 Y2: \$57,000 Y3: \$57,000 <u>Y4: \$57,000</u> Total: \$228,000
023GF-12 CIS	Magdy Bayoumi	University of Louisiana at Lafayette	Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Computer Science and Computer Engineering	4 years 2 PhD @ \$27K	Y1: \$54,000 Y2: \$54,000 Y3: \$54,000 <u>Y4: \$54,000</u> Total: \$216,000
024GF-12 ENG	James Carroll	University of Louisiana at Lafayette	Structural Engineering Program Development Fellowships	2 years 3 MS @ \$20K	Y1: \$60,000 Y2: \$60,000 Total: \$120,000
025GF-12 BIO	Paul Klerks	University of Louisiana at Lafayette	Recruitment of Superior Graduate Students in Environmental & Evolutionary Biology for 2012	4 years 3 PhD @ \$27K	Y1: \$81,000 Y2: \$81,000 Y3: \$81,000 <u>Y4: \$81,000</u> Total: \$324,000
026GF-12 EDU	Belinda Cambre	University of New Orleans	UNO College of Education Urban Education Graduate Fellowship Project	4 years 4 PhD @ \$32K	Y1: \$128,000 Y2: \$128,000 Y3: \$128,000 <u>Y4: \$128,000</u> Total: \$512,000
027GF-12 CHEM	John Wiley	University of New Orleans	Graduate Fellowships for the Doctoral Program in Chemistry at the University of New Orleans	4 years 4 PhD @ \$32K	Y1: \$128,000 Y2: \$128,000 Y3: \$128,000 Y4: \$128,000 Total: \$512,000

TRADITIONAL GRADUATE FELLOWS PROPOSAL SUBMISSION SUMMARY

NUMBER SUBMITTED: 27

Agriculture: 0 Education: 1

Biological Sciences: 5 Engineering A&B: 4

Business: 0 Health & Medical Sciences: 4

Chemistry: 3 Mathematics: 3

Computer & Information Sciences: 2 Physics/Astronomy: 2

Earth/Environmental Sciences: 3

FIRST-YEAR FUNDS REQUESTED: \$2,286,500

TOTAL FUNDS REQESTED: \$8,744,000

TOTAL FIRST-YEAR FUNDS AVAILABLE: \$720,000

Graduate Fellowships for Teachers Program 2010-11 Competition Proposals Submitted

Proposal#/ Discipline	PI Name(s)	Institution	Proposal Title	Duration	Funds Requested
001GFT-12 ED	Byron Launey	LSU-BR	Improving Classroom Interest in Science and Mathematics by Preparing Highly Qualified Teachers 2012-2013	1 year 8 MS @ \$18K	\$144,000
002GFT-12 CHEM	Joseph Sneddon	McNeese State University	MSU's GFT Program for a M.S. in Environmental and Chemical Sciences	1 year 1 MS @ \$26.5K	\$26,500

GRADUATE FELLOWSHIPS FOR TEACHERS PROPOSAL SUBMISSION SUMMARY

NUMBER SUBMITTED: 2

TOTAL FUNDS REQUESTED: \$170,500

TOTAL FIRST-YEAR FUNDS AVAILABLE: \$180,000